# INTERCULTURAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW REVIEW

Vol. 1 2006

## **BOARD OF EDITORS**

BENJAMIN D. MORRIS KRISTINA A. DUHANEY Editors-in-Chief

Gustavo Sardiña Managing Editor

JEANNE BENNETT Executive Editor RAOUL GARCIA Executive Editor

COSMIN CORENDEA
Executive Editor

MOLA BOSLAND-GREGORY

Student Articles Editor

DAVID MCPIKE
Articles & Symposium Editor

AKPOBIBIBO ONDUKU Articles Selection Editor

Thomas Freiwald Symposium Editor

> Professor Siegfried Wiessner Faculty Advisor

### LAW REVIEW GENERAL MEMBERS

Yesenia Arocha
Fatima Ashraf
Kate Arnholt
Adam Barnett
Natale Burns
Marlon Brammer
Sherline Cameron
Melanie Campbell
Fernanda Cavalcanti
Jacqueline Delgado
Timothy Dunfey
Samuel Essien
Elizabeth Fate
Shannon Fitzgerald

Michael Gelety
Melissa Gomberg
Annalie Hernandez
Brian Jacobson
Katariina Juliao
Susan Kelly
Robert Kerr
Danna Magloire
Emily Mallor
Isaac Mamane
Thokozile Gurganious
Kimberly Melde
Adam Miller
Cecilia Millan

Jessica Pacheco
Madhurima Paturi
Jason Pieczonka
Robin Pimentel
Caroline Portuondo
Eduardo Rivera
Bianca Robinson
Aditi Sehgal
Melinda Shabka
Pamela Shannon
Jessica Spicer
James Thorpe
Maya Broome-Webster
Sarah Walton
Susan Wilder

# **FOUNDING BOARD OF EDITORS (2004-2005)**

GIEV ASKARI MICHAEL BLEVINS *Editors-in-Chief* 

TIMOTHY DUNFEY Managing Editor

ADAM BARNETT Executive Editor

QERIM QERIMI Executive Editor

FERNANDA CAVALCANTI Executive Editor DEBORAH DAWSON Articles & Symposium Editor

Professor Siegfried Wiessner Faculty Advisor

## INTERNATIONAL EDITORIAL ADVISORY BOARD

Professor W. Michael Reisman, Ph.D. Myres S. McDougal Professor of Law, Yale Law School Former President, Inter-American Commission of Human Rights

Professor Dr. iur. Eckart Klein University of Potsdam Faculty of Law Former Member, United Nations Human Rights Committee

Professor Dr. iur. Erica-Irene Daes

Former Member, United Nations Subcommission for the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights and Chairperson, United Nations Working Group on Indigenous Populations (1984-2000)

Dr. iur. Toni Pfanner
Editor-in-Chief, International Review of the Red Cross
Former Chief Legal Advisor, International Committee of the Red Cross

Professor Dr. Domingo Acevedo Former Deputy Executive Secretary Inter-American Commission of Human Rights

Professor Dr. iur. Herbert Petzold University of Saarbrücken Faculty of Law Former Registrar, European Court of Human Rights

Professor Pierre-Michel Fontaine, Ph.D.

Former Principal Legal Advisor, United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees and Director, Office of the UNHCHR in the Democratic Republic of Congo

Professor Dr. Christoph Heyns
Director, Center for Human Rights
University of Pretoria Faculty of Law, South Africa

Professor Dr. iur. Kalliopi Koufa University of Thessaloniki Faculty of Law

Member, UN Sub-Commission on the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights United Nations Special Rapporteur on Human Rights and Terrorism

Professor David J. Padilla
Former Assistant Executive Secretary
Inter-American Commission of Human Rights

Professor Frans Viljoen
Editor-in-Chief, African Human Rights Law Journal
Professor of Law, Center for Human Rights
University of Pretoria Faculty of Law, South Africa

Professor Dr. iur. Martin Nettesheim

Dean and Professor of Public Law, European Law and International Law
University of Tübingen Faculty of Law, Germany

Rev. Msgr. Andrew Anderson, J.C.D. Associate Director of Student Affairs, Chaplain and Adjunct Professor of Law St. Thomas University School of Law

Professor Dr. Jonathan Cohen
Director, Hebrew Union College
Center for the Study of Ethics and Contemporary Moral Problems
University of Cincinnati

Professor Nora V. Demleitner
Vice Dean for Academic Affairs and Professor of Law
Hofstra School of Law

# **ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

#### Chair:

Roza Pati, LL.M., Dr. iur. Candidate Executive Director and Adjunct Professor of Law Graduate Program in Intercultural Human Rights St. Thomas University School of Law

Members:

Roy Balleste, LL.M., J.S.D. Candidate
Associate Law Library Director and Adjunct Professor of Law
Nova Southeastern University Shepard Broad Law Center

Gabriel Damian Pinilla, Esq.
WardKim LLLP
Former Editor-in-Chief, St. Thomas Law Review

Edward Tapanes, Esq., LL.M. Assistant State Attorney Miami, Florida

Ana Isabel Vallejo, Esq., LL.M. Staff Attorney/LUCHA: A Women's Legal Project Florida Immigrant Advocacy Center

Denise Wallace, Esq.,LL.M., J.S.D. Candidate

#### GENERAL INFORMATION

The *Intercultural Human Rights Law Review* is published once a year and is an internationally distributed legal publication.

**Submissions**. The *Intercultural Human Rights Law Review* invites the submission of manuscripts on topics of interest in the field of human rights and related issues. All text and footnotes should be double-spaced. Manuscripts should be formatted in Microsoft Word version 6.0 or greater. Our preference is to receive submissions in digital format. Our e-mail address is ihrlawreview@stu.edu. Footnotes should conform to *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (18th ed. 2005). The *Review* retains the right to determine the final form of every article. The *Review* acknowledges the receipt of submitted manuscripts, and assumes no responsibility for the return of submissions.

**Subscriptions**. The subscription price is \$30.00 per year, and \$38.00 per year for foreign subscribers. All subscriptions are for one year unless otherwise requested and are renewed automatically unless the subscriber sends timely notice of termination. Please inform the *Review* promptly of any change of address by sending the new address and a mailing label with the former address.

**Citation.** All references to materials included in the *Intercultural Human Rights Law Review* conform to *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (18th ed. 2005), published by the Harvard Law Review Association.

**Correspondence**. All correspondence should be addressed to:

Managing Editor

Intercultural Human Rights Law Review
16401 N.W. 37th Avenue
Miami Gardens, Florida 33054-6459
ihrlawreview@stu.edu

# St. Thomas University School of Law

#### **ADMINISTRATION**

Reverend Monsignor Franklyn M. Casale, B.A., S.T.B., M.Div., *President, St. Thomas University* 

Robert A. Butterworth, B.S.B.A., J.D., Dean and Professor of Law

Alfredo Garcia, B.A., M.A., J.D., Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and Professor of Law

George H. Sheldon, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean for Student and Alumni Services

Karl T. Gruben, B.A., M.L.S., J.D., Law Library Director and Associate Professor of Law

Barbara Singer, B.A., J.D., L.L.B., Assistant Dean for Academic Support and Visiting Associate Professor of Law

Iraida Acebo, B.A., Law School Registrar

Monsignor Andrew Anderson, B.A., M.Div., C.P.E., J.C.B., J.C.L., J.D.L., Associate Director for Student Affairs and Chaplain

William H. Byrnes, III, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Professor of Law and Director, Graduate Program in International Taxation

Cheryl D. Chapman, B.A., M.S.Ed., Ph.D., Director for Development

Alana Dasent, B.A., J.D., Director of Career Services

Cecile Dykas, B.A., J.D., Director of Clinical Programs and Visiting Assistant Professor of Law

Larry Fedro, B.S., J.D., Director, Tax Clinic

John F. Hernandez, B.S., J.D., LL.M., Director of Student Affairs and Associate Professor of Law

Fareza Khan, B.A., M.S., Director of Admissions

Olga Leyva, B.A., Budget and Building Manager

Karen Malin, B.A., M.A., Director of Communications and Marketing

Richard H.W. Maloy, A.B., J.D., LL.M., Director of Summer-in-Spain Program and Visiting Associate Professor of Law

Amanda Maroul, A.B.J., J.D., Director of Alumni Affairs and Special Events

Christopher Pantaleon, Director of Student Support Services

Roza Pati, B.A., LL.M., Dr. iur. Candidate, Executive Director, Graduate Program in Intercultural Human Rights

Siegfried Wiessner, J.D., LL.M., Dr. iur., Professor of Law and Director, Graduate Program in Intercultural Human Rights

#### LAW FACULTY

Benton Becker, B.A., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law

Gordon T. Butler, B.E.E., J.D., LL.M., M.B.A., Professor of Law

William H. Byrnes, III, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Professor of Law and Director, Graduate Program in International Taxation

Beckett Cantley, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Visiting Assistant Professor of Law

Anna M. Chan, A.B., J.D., Associate Professor

Steven Clark, B.A., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law

Cecile Dykas, B.A., J.D., Director of Clinical Programs and Visiting Assistant Professor of Law

Larry Fedro, B.S., J.D., Director of the Tax Clinic

Kenneth Feldman, B.A., J.D., Director of Community Outreach and Pro Bono Services and Adjunct Professor

Alfredo Garcia, B.A., M.A., J.D., Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and Professor of Law

Lauren Gilbert, B.A., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law

Daniel R. Gordon, B.A., M.S., M.P.A., J.D., Professor of Law

John F. Hernandez, B.S., J.D., LL.M., Director of Student Affairs and Visiting Associate Professor of Law

Beverly Horsburgh, B.A., J.D., Professor of Law

John Min Kang, B.A., J.D., M.A., Assistant Professor of Law

Tamara Lawson, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Assistant Professor of Law

Lenora P. Ledwon, B.A., M.A., J.D., Ph.D., Professor of Law

Alfred R. Light, B.A., Ph.D., J.D., Professor of Law

Charles I. Lugosi, LL.B., LL.M., M.B.E., S.J.D., Assistant Professor of Law

Kathleen Mahoney, B.A., M.S., J.D., Associate Professor

John Makdisi, B.A., J.D., S.J.D., Professor of Law

June Mary Makdisi, B.A., M.S., J.D., Professor of Law

Richard H.W. Maloy, A.B., J.D., LL.M., Director of Summer-in-Spain Spain Program and Visiting Associate Professor of Law

Elizabeth A. Pendo, B.A., J.D., Professor of Law

Leonard D. Pertnoy, A.B., B.A., J.D., Professor of Law

Valerie Phillips, B.A., J.D., Visiting Assistant Professor of Law

Stephen Plass, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Professor of Law

Amy D. Ronner, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., J.D., Professor of Law

Harriet Rubin Roberts, B.A., J.D., Visiting Assistant Professor of Law

Sandra C. Ruffin, B.A., J.D., Visiting Associate Professor of Law

Jay Silver, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Professor of Law

Barbara Singer, A.B., J.D., LL.B., Assistant Dean for Academic Support and Visiting Associate Professor of Law

Michael Vastine, B.A., M.A., J.D., Instructor

Siegfried Wiessner, J.D., LL.M., Dr. iur., Professor of Law and Director, Graduate Program in Intercultural Human Rights

Mark J. Wolff, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Professor of Law

Carol Zeiner, B.S., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law

#### ADJUNCT FACULTY

Magda Abdo-Gomez Jeffrey Allen Bruce Alexander Rev. Msgr. Andrew Anderson

Barry Auguste Robert Bloink Howard Blumberg Richard Brodsky

Judge Michael Chavies Attilio M. Costabel

Larry Davis

Judge Ronald Dresnick

Jeffrey Ehrlich Kenneth Feldman Judge Ana Gardiner Judge David Gersten Juan Carlos Gomez Murray Greenberg Judge Amy Karan Gary Kravitz Judge David Levy Robert F. Lewis

Richard Lorenzo

Scott Mager

Timothy Martin
James McDonald
Thomas Messana
Kenneth Noto
Charles Radlauer
Patricia Redmond
Valerie Rennert
Nilsa Brenda Rivera-Lopez
Herman J. Russomanno
D. Jean Ryan
Stuart Saltzman
Jacqueline Schneider
Judge Frank Shephard
Martin Soll
Judge Ronald Sonom

John Stanley Marcus

Judge Daryl Trawick
Eric Von Salzon
Richard Weiss
Steve Wise
John Young
Enrique Zamora

Rory Stein

Todd Sullivan

## LAW LIBRARY ADMINISTRATION AND STAFF

Karl T. Gruben, B.A., M.L.S., J.D., Law Library Director and Associate Professor of Law

Sonia Luna-Lamas, B.A., M.L.S., Associate Law Librarian and Head of Technical Services

June Buchanan, B.A., M.L.S., Cataloger/Bibliographic Control Coordinator

Robert Hudson, B.A., M.A., J.D., M.L.I.S., Faculty Services Librarian

José A. Soto, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Evening Reference Services Librarian

Ned Swanner, B.A., J.D., LL.M., M.A., Head of Public Services

Danniza Inguanzo, Cataloging/Database Specialist

Amado Lugo, Multimedia/Access Services Specialist

Judith Peguero, Access Services/Collection Management Assistant

Naomi Perez, Acquisitions Specialist

Martha Valle, Accounting Operations Assistant

Jocelyn Johnson, Serials/Continuations Specialist