

# INTERCULTURAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW REVIEW

---

Vol. 3

2008

---

## BOARD OF EDITORS

TERESITA M. PEREZ  
ELVIS GALABE NTUNGWEN  
*Editors-in-Chief*

FRANK MALPIGLI  
*Managing Editor*

MATTHEW PRIETT  
*Executive Editor*

ROBERT STACCHINI  
*Student Articles Editor*

RYAN RAMSTAD  
*Executive Editor*

ADRY PLANAS  
*Articles & Symposium Editor*

KRISTEN JAI-MIL BELL  
*Executive Editor*

KALKIDAN N. OBSE  
*Articles & Symposium Editor*

---

PROFESSOR SIEGFRIED WIESSNER  
*Faculty Advisor*

---

## LAW REVIEW GENERAL MEMBERS

Kendrick Almaguer	Richard Grillo	Victoria Mesa
Michele Bachoon	Matthew Gripp	Carlos Monarrez
Anthony Bello	Alfred Guerra	Tanya Newman
Tatiana Bessonova	Meredith Hall	Rochelle Nunez
Slava Borshechukov	Thamar Harrigan	Ugochukwu Nwadike
Romina Caminada	David Hollander	Michael Pelaez
Tatiana da Cunha	Simul Jhaveri	Geoffrey Pette
Fiorella Del Aguila	Sarina Khatani	Jennifer Portwood
Melissa Dominguez	Christina Lago	Frederik Ratliff
Kadiro Amae Elemo	Yara Lorenzo	Kurt Schlueter
Narcy Fajardo	Jennifer Maldonado	Schuyler Smith
Teddra Gadson	Kevin McGarry	Yekaterina Terentieva
Raizha Godoy	Shani McKenzie	Amy Williams
Elizabeth Gonzalez	Eric Medoff	Esperanza Zambrano

## INTERNATIONAL EDITORIAL ADVISORY BOARD

*Professor W. Michael Reisman, Ph.D.*

Myres S. McDougal Professor of Law, Yale Law School  
Former President, Inter-American Commission of Human Rights

*Professor Dr. iur. Eckart Klein*

University of Potsdam Faculty of Law  
Former Member, United Nations Human Rights Committee

*Professor Dr. iur. Erica-Irene Daes*

Former Member, United Nations Subcommission for the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights and Chairperson, United Nations Working Group on Indigenous Populations (1984-2000)

*Dr. iur. Toni Pfanner*

Editor-in-Chief, International Review of the Red Cross  
Former Chief Legal Advisor, International Committee of the Red Cross

*Professor Dr. Domingo Acevedo*

Former Deputy Executive Secretary  
Inter-American Commission of Human Rights

*Professor Dr. iur. Herbert Petzold*  
University of Saarbrücken Faculty of Law  
Former Registrar, European Court of Human Rights

*Professor Pierre-Michel Fontaine, Ph.D.*  
Former Principal Legal Advisor, United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees  
and Director, Office of the UNHCHR in the Democratic Republic of Congo

*Professor Dr. Christoph Heyns*  
Dean, University of Pretoria Faculty of Law, South Africa

*Professor Dr. iur. Kalliopi Koufa*  
University of Thessaloniki Faculty of Law  
Member, UN Sub-Commission on the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights  
United Nations Special Rapporteur on Human Rights and Terrorism

*Professor David J. Padilla*  
Former Assistant Executive Secretary  
Inter-American Commission of Human Rights

*Professor Frans Viljoen*  
Editor-in-Chief, African Human Rights Law Journal  
Director, Center for Human Rights  
University of Pretoria Faculty of Law, South Africa

*Professor Dr. iur. Martin Nettesheim*  
Dean and Professor of Public Law, European Law and International Law  
University of Tübingen Faculty of Law, Germany

*Rev. Msgr. Andrew Anderson, J.C.D.*  
Associate Director of Student Affairs, Chaplain and Adjunct Professor of Law  
St. Thomas University School of Law

*Professor Dr. Jonathan Cohen*  
Director, Hebrew Union College  
Center for the Study of Ethics and Contemporary Moral Problems  
University of Cincinnati

*Professor Nora V. Demleitner*  
Dean and Professor of Law  
Hofstra School of Law

## ADVISORY COMMITTEE

*Chair:*

*Roza Pati, LL.M., Dr. iur. Candidate*  
Executive Director and Adjunct Professor of Law  
Graduate Program in Intercultural Human Rights  
St. Thomas University School of Law

*Members:*

*Danielle Boaz, Esq., LL.M.*  
Former Editor-in-Chief, INTERCULTURAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW REVIEW

*Roy Balleste, LL.M., J.S.D. Candidate*  
Law Library Director & Assistant Professor of Law  
Charles N. and Hilda H. M. Mason Law Library  
University of the District of Columbia, David A. Clarke School of Law

*Timothy Dunfey, J.D., CAMS*  
Alhambra Compliance Consultants  
Founding Managing Editor, INTERCULTURAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW REVIEW

*Gabriel Damian Pinilla, Esq.*  
WardKim LLLP  
Former Editor-in-Chief, ST. THOMAS LAW REVIEW

*Edward Tapanes, Esq., LL.M.*  
Assistant State Attorney  
Miami, Florida

*Ana Isabel Vallejo, Esq., LL.M.*  
Staff Attorney/LUCHA: A Women's Legal Project  
Florida Immigrant Advocacy Center

*Denise Wallace, Esq., LL.M., J.S.D. Candidate*

## GENERAL INFORMATION

The *Intercultural Human Rights Law Review* is published once a year and is an internationally distributed legal publication.

**Submissions.** The *Intercultural Human Rights Law Review* invites the submission of manuscripts on topics of interest in the field of human rights and related issues. All text and footnotes should be double-spaced. Manuscripts should be formatted in Microsoft Word version 6.0 or greater. Our preference is to receive submissions in digital format. Our e-mail address is [ihrlawreview@stu.edu](mailto:ihrlawreview@stu.edu). Footnotes should conform to *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (18th ed. 2005). The *Review* retains the right to determine the final form of every article. The *Review* acknowledges the receipt of submitted manuscripts, and assumes no responsibility for the return of submissions.

**Subscriptions.** The subscription price is \$30.00 per year, and \$38.00 per year for foreign subscribers. All subscriptions are for one year unless otherwise requested and are renewed automatically unless the subscriber sends timely notice of termination. Please inform the *Review* promptly of any change of address by sending the new address and a mailing label with the former address.

**Citation.** All references to materials included in the *Intercultural Human Rights Law Review* conform to *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (18th ed. 2005), published by the Harvard Law Review Association.

**Correspondence.** All correspondence should be addressed to:

Managing Editor  
*Intercultural Human Rights Law Review*  
16401 N.W. 37th Avenue  
Miami Gardens, Florida 33054-6459  
[ihrlawreview@stu.edu](mailto:ihrlawreview@stu.edu)

# ST. THOMAS UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

## ADMINISTRATION

- Reverend Monsignor Franklyn M. Casale, B.A., S.T.B., M.Div.,  
*President, St. Thomas University*
- Alfredo García, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Dean and Professor of Law*
- Cecile Dykas, B.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Academic Affairs/ Director of  
Clinical Programs and Visiting Assistant Professor of Law*
- John F. Hernandez, B.S., J.D., LL.M., *Assistant Dean for Student Affairs and  
Visiting Associate Professor of Law*
- Barbara Singer, B.A., J.D., LL.B., *Assistant Dean for Academic Support and  
Visiting Associate Professor of Law*
- Iraida Acebo, B.A., *Law School Registrar*
- Monsignor Andrew Anderson, B.A., M.Div., C.P.E., J.C.B., J.C.L., J.D.L.,  
*Associate Director for Student Affairs and Chaplain/ Director of Summer-in-  
Spain Program*
- Linda Collins Hertz, B.A., J.D., *Supervisor, Moot Court Competition Team*
- Rev. Raúl Fernández-Calienes, B.A., M.Div., M.A.R., Ph.D., *Executive Assistant  
to the Dean and Visiting Associate Professor of Legal Writing Skills*
- Karl T. Gruben, B.A., M.L.S., J.D., *Law Library Director and  
Associate Professor of Law*
- Peter T. Kelly, B.A., J.D., *Director of Student Services/ Special Assistant to the  
President*
- Fareza Khan, B.A., M.S., *Director of Admissions*
- Judge David L. Levy, B.A., J.D., *Director of Professionalism*
- Olga Leyva, B.A., *Budget and Building Manager*
- Karen Malin, B.A., M.A., *Director of Communications and Marketing*
- Anthony C. Musto, B.G.S., J.D., *Director of Community Outreach and Pro Bono  
Services, Assistant Professor of Law*
- Roza Pati, B.A., LL.M., J.D., *Executive Director, Graduate Program in  
Intercultural Human Rights*
- Mercedes Pino, B.S., J.D., *Director of Career Services*
- Sr. Patricia A. Siemen, OP, B.A., M.P.A., J.D., M.A., *Director, Center for  
Earth Jurisprudence*
- Todd Sullivan, B.A., J.D., *Director of Academic Support*
- Siegfried Wiessner, J.D., LL.M., Dr. iur., *Professor of Law and Director,  
Graduate Program in Intercultural Human Rights*

## LAW FACULTY

Benton Becker, B.A., J.D., *Visiting Professor of Law*  
Gordon T. Butler, B.E.E., J.D., LL.M., M.B.A., *Professor of Law*  
Anna M. Chan, A.B., J.D., *Director of Legal Writing/Associate Professor,*  
*Legal Writing Department*  
Carlo D'Angelo, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor, Legal Writing Department*  
Cece Dykas, B.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Academic Affairs/ Director of Clinical*  
*Programs and Visiting Assistant Professor of Law*  
Larry Fedro, B.S., J.D., *Clinical Instructor*  
Rev. Raúl Fernández-Calienes, B.A., M. Div., M.A.R., Ph.D., *Executive Assistant*  
*to the Dean and Visiting Associate Professor of Legal Writing Skills*  
Jessica Fonseca-Nader, B.S., J.D., *Assistant Professor, Legal Writing Department*  
Alfredo Garcia, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Dean and Professor of Law*  
Lauren Gilbert, B.A., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*  
Daniel R. Gordon, B.A., M.S., M.P.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*  
Karl T. Gruben, B.A., M.L.S., J.D., *Law Library Director and Professor of Law*  
John F. Hernandez, B.S., J.D., LL.M., *Assistant Dean of Student Affairs and*  
*Visiting Associate Professor of Law*  
Beverly Horsburgh, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*  
John Min Kang, B.A., J.D., M.A., *Assistant Professor of Law*  
Tamara Lawson, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Associate Professor of Law*  
Lenora P. Ledwon, B.A., M.A., J.D., Ph.D., *Professor of Law*  
Alfred R. Light, B.A., Ph.D., J.D., *Professor of Law*  
Kathleen Mahoney, B.A., M.S., J.D., *Associate Professor,*  
*Legal Writing Department*  
John Makdisi, B.A., J.D., S.J.D., *Professor of Law*  
June Mary Makdisi, B.A., M.S., J.D., *Professor of Law*  
Richard H.W. Maloy, A.B., J.D., LL.M., *Visiting Associate Professor of Law*  
Ira Nathenson, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*  
Leonard D. Pertnoy, A.B., B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*  
Lydie Pierre-Louis, A.B., M.P.A./M.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*  
Stephen Plass, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law*  
Paula Revene, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor, Legal Writing Department*  
Amy D. Ronner, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., J.D., *Professor of Law*  
Harriet Rubin-Roberts, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*  
Sandra C. Ruffin, B.A., J.D., *Visiting Professor of Law*  
Jay Silver, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law*  
Barbara Singer, A.B., J.D., LL.B., *Assistant Dean for Academic Support and*  
*Visiting Associate Professor of Law*  
Nadia Soree, B.M., M.M., J.D., *Visiting Assistant Professor*  
Michael Vastine, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Clinical Instructor*  
Siegfried Wiessner, J.D., LL.M., Dr. iur., *Director, Graduate Program in*  
*Intercultural Human Rights and Professor of Law*  
Mark J. Wolff, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law*  
Carol Zeiner, B.S., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*

## ADJUNCT FACULTY

Magda Abdo-Gomez  
Bruce Alexander  
Jeffrey Allen  
Rev. Msgr. Andrew Anderson  
Joni Armstrong-Coffey  
Enrique Arroyo  
Howard Blumberg  
Judge Michael Chavies  
Attilio M. Costabel  
Larry S. Davis  
Jeffrey Ehrlich  
Judge Ana Gardiner  
Judge David Gersten  
Murray Greenberg  
Linda C. Hertz  
Judge Amy Karan  
Gary Kravitz  
Robert F. Lewis

Richard Lorenzo  
John Stanley Marcus  
Timothy Martin  
James McDonald  
Kenneth Noto  
Brenda Rivera-Lopez  
Herman Russomanno  
Jon A. Sale  
Stuart Saltzman  
Jacqueline Schneider  
Judge Frank Shephard  
Judge Ronald Sonom  
Rory Stein  
Daniel J. Stermer  
Todd Sullivan  
John R. Young  
Enrique Zamora

## LAW LIBRARY ADMINISTRATION AND STAFF

Karl T. Gruben, B.A., M.L.S., J.D., *Law Library Director and Professor of Law*  
John Beatty, B.S., M.S.L.I.S., *Media Services Librarian*  
Kathleen Brown, B.S.A., J.D., M.L.I.S., *Student and Faculty Services Librarian*  
June Liptay, B.A., M.L.S., *Cataloger/Bibliographic Control Coordinator*  
Sonia Luna-Lamas, B.A., M.L.S., *Associate Law Librarian and Head  
of Technical Services*  
José A. Soto, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Evening Reference Services Librarian*  
Danniza Inguanzo, *Cataloging/Database Specialist*  
Amado Lugo, *Multimedia/Stack Maintenance Specialist*  
Judith Peguero, *Access Services/Collection Management Assistant*  
Naomi Perez, *Acquisitions Specialist*  
Martha Valle, *Accounting Operations Assistant*