

# INTERCULTURAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW REVIEW

---

Vol. 7

2012

---

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### JUSTICE AT THE DOOR: ENDING DOMESTIC SERVITUDE

*Intercultural Human Rights Law Review Annual Symposium  
January 27, 2012*

The President's Welcome Address .....	<i>Rev. Monsignor Franklyn M. Casale</i>	1
Opening Remarks.....	<i>Dean Douglas Ray</i>	5
Domestic Servitude: A Contemporary Form of Slavery .....	<i>Roza Pati</i>	9
<i>Back to Freedom: From Surviving to Thriving</i> An Introduction.....	<i>Ana I. Vallejo</i>	21
<i>Back to Freedom: From Surviving to Thriving. A Panel</i> Discussion.....	<i>Ana I. Vallejo, Simone Celestin, Sabrina Salomon</i>	35

Ensuring Decent Work for Domestic Workers:  
An Integral Approach to the Prevention of  
Labor Trafficking.....*Mark Ensalaco* 45

Human Trafficking and Diplomatic Immunity:  
Impunity No More?.....*Martina E. Vandenberg & Alexandra F. Levy* 77

U.S. Anti-Trafficking Policy and the J-1 Visa Program:  
The State Department's Challenge from Within  
.....*Patricia Medige & Catherine Griebel Bowman* 103

The New York Domestic Workers' Bill of Rights:  
Justice at the Door .....*Talle D. Gilmore* 147

Modern-Day Slavery Eclipsing the Sunshine State  
Compels Safe Harbor Legislation in Florida.....*Lydia Butler* 191

#### ARTICLES

Double Jeopardy in the Inter-American System of Human Rights:  
Balancing the Right and the Remedy.....*Lisl Brunner* 243

Equality, Procedural Justice, and the World Trade  
Organization.....*Adam S. Chilton & Ryan W. Davis* 277

Extreme Makeover - Contract Law Edition:  
A New Home for Human Rights and Social  
Responsibility (Lessons from Israel).....*Eli Bukspan* 329

# INTERCULTURAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW REVIEW

---

Vol. 7

2012

---

## BOARD OF EDITORS

ERIN POGUE  
GIADA LEPORE  
*Editors-in-Chief*

TALLE GILMORE  
*Managing Editor*

GIAN A. ROSSARIO  
*Executive Editor*

MICHELLE YONG  
*Executive Editor*

ELIZABETH BOWDEN  
*Executive Editor*

LAZARITA CHUMPITAZI  
*Executive Editor*

MAX LOPEZ  
*Student Articles Editor*

ADAM YORMACK  
*Symposium & Articles  
Procurement Editor*

---

PROFESSOR SIEGFRIED WIESSNER  
PROFESSOR ROZA PATI  
*Faculty Advisors*

---

## LAW REVIEW GENERAL MEMBERS

Nazish Ahmad	Renee Jadusingh	Alejandra Rosero
Alexandra Audate	Daniel Jovanov	Alexandra Salvador
Louisa Barnes	Ryan Korsunky	Brad Scheslinger
Kristina Billan	Justin Leftko	Ryan Shaw
Francoise Blanco	Jennifer Levy	Janelle Shoemake
Jacqueline Bowden	Marti Louden	Lauren M. Smith
David Cantor	Neidy Marcelo	Sarah Strickland
Mindy Clarke	Melissa Mastrapa	Tina Trunzo
Veronica Cordova	Glorian Maziarka	Janette Valdes
Christina Delgado	Francis A. Minton	Andres Vasquez
Allari Dominguez	Laura Muniz	Justin Werthan
Sarah Dunaway	Father Linus Nangwele	Denise Yeakey
Natalie Eusebe	Alexandria Nguyen	Ben Zeskind
Matthew Ferran	Maritza Pasternak	
Peter Falowo	Nicole Perez	
Catherine Galvis	Isabella Poschl	
Sean Gold	Garcendi Registre	
Lisette Hall	Miriam Revoredo	
Aileen Hernandez	Alberto Rodriguez	

## INTERNATIONAL EDITORIAL ADVISORY BOARD

*Professor W. Michael Reisman, Ph.D.*

Myres S. McDougal Professor of Law, Yale Law School  
Former President, Inter-American Commission of Human Rights

*Professor Dr. iur. Eckart Klein*

University of Potsdam Faculty of Law  
Former Member, United Nations Human Rights Committee

*Professor Nora V. Demleitner*

Dean and Roy L. Steinheimer, Jr. Professor of Law  
Washington and Lee School of Law

*Professor Dr. iur. Erica-Irene Daes*

Former Member, United Nations Subcommission for the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights and Chairperson, United Nations Working Group on Indigenous Populations (1984-2000)

*The Honorable Fausto Pocar, Ph.D.*

Former President, International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia  
Professor of Law, University of Milan, Italy

*Professor Dr. iur. Herbert Petzold*

University of Saarbrücken Faculty of Law  
Former Registrar, European Court of Human Rights

*Dr. iur. Toni Pfanner*

Former Editor-in-Chief, International Review of the Red Cross  
Former Chief Legal Advisor, International Committee of the Red Cross

*Professor Dr. Domingo Acevedo*

Former Deputy Executive Secretary  
Inter-American Commission of Human Rights

*Professor Pierre-Michel Fontaine, Ph.D.*

Former Principal Legal Advisor, United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees  
Former Director, Office of the UNHCHR in the Democratic Republic of Congo

*Professor Dr. Christoph Heyns*

Dean, University of Pretoria Faculty of Law, South Africa

*José Miguel Vivanco*

Director, Human Rights Watch, Americas Division  
Washington, D.C.

*Professor Dr. iur. Kalliopi Koufa*

University of Thessaloniki Faculty of Law  
Former United Nations Special Rapporteur on Human Rights and Terrorism

*Professor Vivian Krsticevic*

Executive Director, Center for Justice and International Law  
Washington, D.C.

*Professor Frans Viljoen*

Editor-in-Chief, African Human Rights Law Journal  
Director, Center for Human Rights  
University of Pretoria Faculty of Law, South Africa

*Professor Federico Lenzerini*

University of Siena, Italy

*Professor Dr. iur. Martin Nettesheim*

Professor of Public Law, European Law and International Law  
University of Tübingen Faculty of Law, Germany

*Professor Dr. Jonathan Cohen*

Dean, Hebrew Union College, University of Cincinnati

## GENERAL INFORMATION

The *Intercultural Human Rights Law Review* is published once a year and is an internationally distributed legal publication.

**Submissions.** The *Intercultural Human Rights Law Review* invites the submission of manuscripts on topics of interest in the field of human rights and related issues. All text and footnotes should be double-spaced. Manuscripts should be formatted in Microsoft Word version 6.0 or greater. Our preference is to receive submissions in digital format. Our e-mail address is [ihrlawreview@stu.edu](mailto:ihrlawreview@stu.edu). Footnotes should conform to *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (19th ed. 2010). The *Review* retains the right to determine the final form of every article. The *Review* acknowledges the receipt of submitted manuscripts, and assumes no responsibility for the return of submissions.

**Subscriptions.** The subscription price is \$30.00 per year, and \$38.00 per year for foreign subscribers. All subscriptions are for one year unless otherwise requested and are renewed automatically unless the subscriber sends timely notice of termination. Please inform the *Review* promptly of any change of address by sending the new address and a mailing label with the former address.

**Citation.** All references to materials included in the *Intercultural Human Rights Law Review* conform to *The Bluebook: A Uniform System of Citation* (19th ed. 2010), published by the Harvard Law Review Association.

**Correspondence.** All correspondence should be addressed to:

Managing Editor  
INTERCULTURAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW REVIEW  
16401 N.W. 37th Avenue  
Miami Gardens, Florida 33054-6459  
[ihrlawreview@stu.edu](mailto:ihrlawreview@stu.edu)

## **ST. THOMAS UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW**

### **ADMINISTRATION**

- Reverend Monsignor Franklyn M. Casale, B.A., S.T.B., M.Div.,  
*President, St. Thomas University*
- Douglas E. Ray, B.A., J.D., *Dean and Professor of Law*
- Cecile Dykas, B.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Academic Affairs, Director of  
Clinical Program and Visiting Associate Professor of Law*
- John F. Hernandez, B.S., J.D., LL.M., *Assistant Dean for Student Affairs and  
Visiting Associate Professor of Law*
- Barbara Singer, B.A., J.D., LL.B., *Assistant Dean for Academic Support and  
Visiting Associate Professor of Law*
- Peter T. Kelly, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Dean for Alumni Relations*
- Iraida Acebo, B.A., *Law School Registrar*
- The Rev. Monsignor Andrew Anderson, B.A., M.Div., C.P.E., J.C.B., J.C.L.,  
J.D.L., *Associate Director of Student Affairs, Chaplain and Director of  
Summer- in-Spain Program*
- Roy Balleste, B.A., J.D., M.L.S., LL.M., J.S.D., *Law Library Director and  
Professor of Law*
- Jiovanna Bryant, B.A., *Director for Admissions*
- Larry C. Fedro, *Director of the Tax Clinic*
- The Rev. Raúl Fernández-Calienes, B.A., M.Div., M.A.R., Ph.D., *Coordinator of  
Writing Skills and Visiting Associate Professor of Legal Writing Skills*
- The Honorable David L. Levy, B.A., J.D., *Director of Professionalism*
- Olga Leyva, B.A., *Budget and Building Manager*
- Alfred R. Light, *Director, Graduate Program in Environmental Sustainability and  
Professor of Law*
- Roza Pati, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Dr. iur., *Executive Director, Graduate Program in  
Intercultural Human Rights and Professor of Law*
- Mercedes Pino, B.S., J.D., *Director of Career Services*
- Jennifer Portwood, B.A., J.D., *Director of Pro Bono Programs and Public Service  
Career Counselor*
- Keith W. Rizzardi, B.A., J.D., M.S., *Assistant Director, Graduate Program in  
Environmental Sustainability and Assistant Professor of Law*
- Todd Sullivan, B.A., J.D., *Director of Academic Support and Visiting Assistant  
Professor of Law*
- Siegfried Wiessner, J.D., LL.M., Dr. iur., *Director, Graduate Program in  
Intercultural Human Rights and Professor of Law*

## ***LAW FACULTY***

Roy Balleste, B.A., J.D., M.L.S., LL.M., J.S.D., *Law Library Director and Professor of Law*

Gordon T. Butler, B.E.E., J.D., LL.M., M.B.A., *Professor of Law*

Anna M. Chan, A.B., J.D., *Director of Legal Writing and Associate Professor of Legal Writing Department*

Dennis Corgill, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Associate Professor of Law*

Cecile L. Dykas, B.A., J.D., *Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and Director of Clinical Program and Visiting Assistant Professor*

Rev. Raúl Fernández-Calienes, B.A., M. Div., M.A.R., Ph.D., *Coordinator of Writing Skills and Visiting Associate Professor of Legal Writing Skills*

Jessica Fonseca-Nader, B.S., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Legal Writing Department*

Alfredo Garcia, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*

Lauren Gilbert, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*

Marc-Tizoc Gonzalez, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*

John F. Hernandez, B.S., J.D., LL.M., *Assistant Dean for Student Affairs and Visiting Associate Professor of Law*

Alicia Hogges-Thomas, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*

Beverly Horsburgh, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*

John Min Kang, B.A., J.D., M.A., Ph.D., *Professor of Law*

Gary Kravitz, B.S., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Legal Writing Department*

Tamara Lawson, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law*

Lenora P. Ledwon, B.A., M.A., J.D., Ph.D., *Professor of Law*

Alfred R. Light, B.A., Ph.D., J.D., *Professor of Law and Director, Graduate Program in Environmental Sustainability*

Kathleen Mahoney, B.A., M.S., J.D., *Associate Professor of Legal Writing Department*

John Makdisi, B.A., J.D., S.J.D., *Professor of Law*

June Mary Makdisi, B.A., M.S., J.D., *Professor of Law*

Richard H.W. Maloy, A.B., J.D., LL.M., *Professor Emeritus*

Jennifer S. Martin, B.S., J.D., *Professor of Law*

Robert E. Mensel, B.A., J.D., M.A., Ph.D., *Associate Professor of Law*

Patricia Hatamyar Moore, B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*

Anthony Musto, B.G.S., J.D., *Associate Professor of Legal Writing*

Ira Nathenson, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*

Roza Pati, J.D., LL.M., Dr. iur., *Executive Director, Graduate Program in Intercultural Human Rights and Professor of Law*

Leonard D. Pertnoy, A.B., B.A., J.D., *Professor of Law*

Stephen Plass, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law*

Douglas E. Ray, B.A., J.D., *Dean and Professor of Law*  
 Keith W. Rizzardi, B.A., J.D., M.S., *Assistant Director, Graduate Program in Environmental Sustainability and Assistant Professor of Law*  
 Iris Rogatinsky, B.A., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Legal Writing Department*  
 Amy D. Ronner, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., J.D., *Professor of Law*  
 Jay Silver, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law*  
 Barbara Singer, A.B., J.D., LL.B., *Assistant Dean for Academic Support and Visiting Associate Professor of Law*  
 Nadia Soree, B.M., M.M., J.D., *Assistant Professor of Law*  
 Todd Sullivan, B.A., J.D., *Director of Academic Support and Visiting Assistant Professor of Law*  
 Michael Vastine, B.A., M.A., J.D., *Director of Immigration Clinic and Assistant Professor of Law*  
 Siegfried Wiessner, J.D., LL.M., Dr. iur., *Director, Graduate Program in Intercultural Human Rights and Professor of Law*  
 Mark J. Wolff, B.A., J.D., LL.M., *Professor of Law*  
 Carol Zeiner, B.S., J.D., *Professor of Law*

### **ADJUNCT FACULTY**

Magda Abdo-Gomez	Caryn Lubetsky
Bruce Alexander	Richard Lorenzo
Jeffrey Allen	Paul Marcus
Rev. Msgr. Andrew Anderson	The Hon. Stanley Marcus
Howard K. Blumberg	Timothy Martin
The Hon. Michael Chavies	Michael C. Mayer
Joni Coffey	James McDonald
Gary Mitchell Cohen	Rhonda Montoya-Hason
Jay Cohen	Mary Munson
Attilio M. Costabel	Hector O. Nava
Larry S. Davis	Jacqueline Needelman
Steven J. Dell	Kenneth Noto
Sheri Dennis	Martha Perez
Lilliana Farinas-Sabogal	Brenda Rivera-Lopez
James Fierberg	Robert J. Robes
The Hon. Rosa Figarola	Herman Russomanno
The Hon. David M. Gersten	Stuart Saltzman
Murray Greenberg	Jacqueline Schneider
Milton Hirsch	The Hon. Frank Shephard
Joe Holland	The Hon. Michele Towbin Singer
Josef Klee	The Hon. Ronald Sonom
Marvin Klein	Rory Stein
Dana Kulvin	The Hon. Daryl Trawick
Susan Labasky	The Hon. Lisa Walsh
Joseph Landolfi	Steven Wise
Thomas W. Logue	John R. Young
The Hon. Peter R. Lopez	Enrique Zamora

## ***LAW LIBRARY ADMINISTRATION AND STAFF***

Roy Balleste, B.A., J.D., M.L.S., LL.M., J.S.D., *Law Library Director and Professor of Law*  
Sonia Luna-Lamas, B.A., M.L.S., *Associate Director and Head of Technical Services*  
Iris Garcia, B.A., M.L.S., *Technical Services Librarian*  
Courtney Segota, B.A., J.D., M.L.S., *Reference/ Faculty Services Librarian*  
Mathew Gran, B.A., J.D., M.L.I.S., *Evening/ Reference Services Librarian*  
Jacob Hurst, B.S., J.D., *Legal Researcher*  
Edward Douglas, B.S., M.S., *Web/Information Systems Administrator*  
Richard Andre, *Reference/ Circulation Specialist*  
Rosario Cruz, *Serials/ Continuations Specialist*  
Max Ford, *Reference/ Circulation Specialist*  
Diago Gumucio, *Multimedia/ Circulation Specialist*  
Danniza Inguanzo, *Cataloging/ Database Specialist*  
Amado Lugo, *Multimedia/ Stack Maintenance Specialist*  
Judith Peguero, *Accounting Operations Assistant*  
Juan Matos, *Multimedia/ Circulation Specialist*